



Committee and Date

North Planning Committee

17th October 2017

NORTH PLANNING COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting held on 19 September 2017

In the Shrewsbury/Oswestry Room, Shirehall, Abbey Foregate, Shrewsbury, Shropshire, SY2 6ND

2.00 - 2.56 pm

Responsible Officer: Emily Marshall

Email: emily.marshall@shropshire.gov.uk Tel: 01743 257717

Present

Councillor Paul Wynn (Chairman)

Councillors Gerald Dakin, Pauline Dee, Rob Gittins, Roger Hughes, Vince Hunt (Vice Chairman), S. Jones, Paul Milner and Peggy Mullock

29 Apologies for Absence

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Aldcroft (substitute: S. Jones), Aspinall and M. Jones.

30 Minutes

RESOLVED:

That the Minutes of the meeting of the North Planning Committee held on 22nd August 2017 be approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

31 Public Question Time

There were no public questions, statements or petitions received.

32 Disclosable Pecuniary Interests

Members were reminded that they must not participate in the discussion or voting on any matter in which they had a Disclosable Pecuniary Interest and should leave the room prior to the commencement of the debate.

33 The Primitive Chapel, Pool Head, Wem, Shrewsbury, Shropshire (17/02628/FUL)

The Principal Planning Officer introduced the application for the installation of replacement windows under Section 73A of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990. Members' attention was drawn to the Schedule of Additional Letters which summarised the recently received appeal dismissal in respect of Lavender Barn, Clive (Ref APP/I324/W/17/3166592) and its relevance to the application.

In accordance with the Local Protocol for Councillors and Officers dealing with Regulatory Matters (Part 5, Paragraph 15.1) Councillor Mellings as local ward

councillor, made a statement and then left the table, took no part in the debate and did not vote on this item. During his statement, the following points were raised:

- The replacement windows did not cause significant harm to the character of the Chapel;
- The Chapel was not listed, not located within a conservation area and was situated within an isolated rural location;
- The original arched apertures of the windows had not changed;
- The roof light windows and the bricking up of a window had more of a detrimental effect on the character of the building;
- The Parish Council and comments from the general public supported his view that the character of the Chapel had not been harmed; and
- Urged the Committee to take a pragmatic view and to consider the application within the context of the area.

In accordance with the Local Protocol for Councillors and Officers dealing with Regulatory Matters (Part 5, Paragraph 15.1) Councillor Dee as local ward councillor, made a statement and then left the table, took no part in the debate and did not vote on this item. During her statement, the following points were raised:

- She was pleased to see the building saved from dilapidation;
- The original windows were not practical for modern living; and
- The replacement windows improved the look of the building which was still easily recognisable as a former Chapel.

Peter Richards, agent on behalf of the applicant spoke in support of the proposal in accordance with Shropshire Council's Scheme for Public Speaking at Planning Committees.

During the ensuing debate, Members expressed differing views. Some expressed the view that as the original arched apertures remained, the new windows did not harm the character of the Chapel. Other Members supported the Officer's recommendation to refuse the application, as they considered the replacement windows to be unsympathetic to the character of the building, particularly when considering the application in light of the recent appeal dismissal that had been referred to by the Principal Planning Officer.

RESOLVED:

That planning permission be refused for the following reason:

It is considered that the replacement of the existing windows has resulted in the loss of major features within the overall design and distinctive architectural style of the building, and further that the replacement windows that have been installed are incongruous windows of inappropriate design, proportions and materials. The Local Planning Authority considers this has served to significantly detract from the character of the building, harming its significance and diminishing its' value as a local heritage asset. The application is unsupported by a Heritage Assessment to demonstrate or provide justification otherwise. On balance, therefore, the application is considered contrary to adopted planning policies CS5, CS6 and CS17 of the

Shropshire Core Strategy; MD2, MD7(a) and MD13 of Shropshire SAMDev Plan and the Supplementary Planning Document on the Type and Affordability of Housing, together with the national guidance set out in section 12 and paragraph 135 of the NPPF.

34 Property Known As The Lodge, Ellerton, Newport, Shropshire, TF10 8AW (17/01875/FUL)

The Principal Planning Officer introduced the application for the restoration, alterations and extensions to existing dwelling and erection of new dwelling. Members' attention was drawn to the information contained within the Schedule of Additional letters.

In accordance with the Local Protocol for Councillors and Officers dealing with Regulatory Matters (Part 5, Paragraph 15.1) Councillor Gittins as local ward councillor, made a statement and then left the table, took no part in the debate and did not vote on this item. During his statement, the following points were raised in relation to this application and the application for Listed Building Consent:

- He reiterated the objections raised by Cheswardine Parish Council.

Having considered the submitted plans and listened to the comments made by all of the speakers, the majority of Members expressed their support for the proposals, which would have less of an impact on the listed building and ensure its restoration.

RESOLVED:

That delegated powers be granted to the Area Planning Manager to approve planning permission subject to the conditions set out in Appendix 1 of the Officer's report and the additional and amended conditions set out in the Schedule of Additional Letters.

35 Property Known As The Lodge, Ellerton, Newport, Shropshire, TF10 8AW (17/01876/LBC)

The Principal Planning Officer introduced the listed building consent application for the restoration alterations and extensions to existing dwelling and erection of new dwelling. Members' attention was drawn to the information contained within the Schedule of Additional letters.

In accordance with the Local Protocol for Councillors and Officers dealing with Regulatory Matters (Part 5, Paragraph 15.1) Councillor Gittins, as local ward councillor, left the table, took no part in the debate and did not vote on this item.

Having considered the submitted plans, the majority of Members expressed their support for the proposals.

RESOLVED:

That delegated powers be granted to the Area Planning Manager to approve the Listed Building Consent subject to the conditions set out in Appendix 1 of the

Officer's report and the additional and amended conditions set out in the Schedule of Additional Letters.

36 **Appeals and Appeal Decisions**

RESOLVED:

That the appeals and appeal decisions for the northern area be noted.

37 **Date of the Next Meeting**

It was noted that the next meeting of the North Planning Committee would be held at 2.00 p.m. on Tuesday, 17th October 2017, in the Shrewsbury/Oswestry Room, Shirehall, Shrewsbury.

Signed (Chairman)

Date: